



GARY L. PRYOR
DIRECTOR

County of San Diego

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND LAND USE

5201 RUFFIN ROAD, SUITE B, SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92123-1666
INFORMATION (858) 694-2960
TOLL FREE (800) 411-0017

SAN MARCOS OFFICE
151 E Carmel
SAN MARCOS, CA 92078
(760) 471-0730

EL CAJON OFFICE
200 EAST MAIN ST. • SIXTH FLOOR
EL CAJON, CA 92020-3912
(619) 441-4030

BOARD MINUTES

HISTORIC SITE BOARD

April 16, 2007

Approved

(NOTE: The minutes are a summary of the HSB meetings. Cassette tape recordings of the meeting are available upon request. Comments are welcome.)

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

ITEM 1 – ADMINISTRATIVE

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

- **Call to Order**

6:30 pm

- **Members Present:**

Paul Johnson
Carmen Lucas
Jim Royle
Eldonna Lay
Margie Warner
Scott Moomjian

- **Staff Present:**

Glenn Russell
Gail Wright
Donna Beddow

Members Absent: Vicki Estrada

Staff Absent: None

- **Other General Information:** None

B. Conflict of Interest Declaration: Carmen Lucas – Action Item 3

C. Approval of March 19, 2007 Board Minutes

Approval of the March 19, 2007 Board Minutes; Motion by Paul Johnson to approve minutes; 2nd by Eldonna Lay; motion carried 4 – 0 - 1 (Chair. - Jim Royle abstained).

D. Reports:

- CLG Grant for Julian Historic District – Progress Report – Donna Beddow; Grant drafted and almost ready for submission (due April 30, 2007)
- Society for California Archaeology annual meeting – Glenn Russell
- Hidden Lake Ranch – Flagged to notify DPLU staff if permits are applied for
- Thing Brothers' Store, Tecate: Jim to send photos to Scott Moomjian; Paul Johnson requested exact address to continue research on current owner.
- Demolition Ordinance: Chairman Royle requested General Plan 2020 presentation to address this issue.

E. Announcements

- San Diego County Archaeological Society meeting Tuesday April 24, 2007, 7:30pm:
Presenter: Joe Ball, Ph.D. Professor, San Diego State University. "Apocalypto or Apoplecto: Maya Archaeology at SDSU and 'According to Mel' "
- 32nd Annual California Preservation Conference; Roosevelt Hotel in Hollywood, May 3-6, 2007; "Preservation Goes Hollywood".
- State Historical Resources Commission Meeting, May 3, 2007, Hollywood, CA (see handout for details). Meeting will include consideration of the Cuyamaca Village nomination to the NRHP.
- May 22, 2007: CA Alliance for Response: Forum at the Prado in Balboa Park
- National Preservation Institute: In San Diego: October 17-19, 2007: "Section 106: An Introduction".

ITEM 2 – PUBLIC COMMENTS

A. Public Comment: None

B. County Department of Parks and Recreation: Dr. Lynne N. Christenson, Historian, County Parks and Recreation:

- Two National Register Nominations in the works: Camp Lockett and Archaeological Site CA-SDI-507
- Parks has obtained funding to help erase backlog of County Parks that have not yet been surveyed for cultural and biological resources. Development of management plans would be a part of this process.

C. Presentation – None

ACTION ITEMS:

ITEM 3 – CUYAMACA VILLAGE - NATIONAL REGISTER of HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATION (NRHP):

Location: Cuyamaca Rancho State Park, Cuyamaca, CA 91916,

Community Planning Group: Cuyamaca

Supervisor District: 2-Dianne Jacob

Description: *Cuyamaca Village* has been nominated for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. ASM Affiliates, Inc., received a contract to prepare the nomination, and the work was done by Dr. Susan Hector, a Principal with the firm. *Cuyamaca Village*, archaeological site CA-SDI-9538, located in Cuyamaca Rancho State Park, is a Prehistoric Yuman village associated with the

Kumeyaay and Kwaaymii. The site, approximately 55 acres in size, was occupied from antiquity into the historic period when permanent habitation was abandoned circa 1869. The extent of the site was discovered following the 2003 Cedar fires to be greater than previously recognized. In a letter dated February 27, 2007, the State Historic Preservation Officer, Milford Wayne Donaldson, invited the County Historic Site Board to make a recommendation to the State Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) on the nomination. The comment period lasts for 60 days, and ends on April 28, 2007. This will allow the State Historical Resources Commission sufficient time to review all comments prior to their meeting on May 3, 2007.

The OHP letter states in part: "As a Certified Local Government under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, your commission (HSB), after reasonable opportunity for public comment, shall prepare a Report as to whether or not such property, in its opinion, meets the criteria for the National Register."

The focus of the meeting is to decide if the *Cuyamaca Village* Site meets the technical criteria for the National Register listing. The Village is located within Cuyamaca Rancho State Park, and therefore is outside of County jurisdiction relating to land use. This Board does not have any authority to recommend how the Village site is to be managed or used by the Park, the public or Native Americans.

Los Caballos Horse Camp was built on top of a portion of the Village site in the 1950's prior to current, more restrictive environmental laws. The Camp has been a popular camping ground for San Diego County equestrians ever since that time. Staff (the County) is fully aware of the importance of the historic use of the site by the equestrians.

Today's Action: Discuss National Register nomination of Cuyamaca Village Site CA-SDI-9538 and decide if a recommendation should be made to the Office of Historic Preservation and the State Historical Resources Commission. The Board can recommend to support the nomination, not support the nomination, or to not take a position. The Board can also authorize staff to prepare a letter to be sent to the Office of Historic Preservation and the State Historical Resources Commission containing their recommendation.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Historic Site Board find that the *Cuyamaca Village* Site CA-SDI-9538 meets the criteria for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (under Criterion A and Criterion D) and authorize staff to prepare a letter to be sent to the Office of Historic Preservation stating the Board's recommendation of support.

Note: Board member Carmen Lucas recused herself from participation in the discussion and action on this item because of close involvement with the nomination.

Meeting Notes: Representatives of those most closely involved in the nomination were given time at the beginning of the discussion to thoroughly present their views:

- Dr. Susan Hector: Power Point presentation with photographs of the site and a brief summary of the nomination including the details of eligibility for Criteria A and Criteria D, for which this nomination is applying. Integrity of the site was also discussed, as was the fact that the nomination is consistent with California State Parks guidelines.
- James O'Keefe, President, Cuyamaca Rancho State Park Interpretive Association: Mr. O'Keefe read his presentation into the recorded record. A brief summary:

- The nomination includes a proposal that the area subject to the nomination be closed to public use. The restriction on or control of use planning is not a part of the nomination process per se but the nomination as written may be interpreted as a land use planning policy in the future and may lead to conflicts between users such as archeologists, and other users such as hikers, bikers, campers, equestrians, and others, especially those using the roads and trails in the area. As a land use planning policy, it is defective in that it does not meet the required criteria of an archeological plan, a land use plan, or a user group plan, among other critical elements.
 - The area is also the location of Native American historical uses dating back to prehistoric periods. In other words, a site may have multiple and, in some cases, entirely unrelated significance that would make it eligible for listing or consideration for listing on the National Register. We therefore support a nomination which includes Stonewall Mine, Cuyamaca City, Los Caballos Family Horse Camp, and the Native American village site.
 - Recommends that the San Diego County Historic Site Board defer taking any action regarding the proposed nomination pending a review of the Park's general management document and policies and requests an extension of time within which to fully review the matter and the consequences of this nomination on user groups within the Park. Without such a policy and guiding document it is difficult if not impossible to appropriately evaluate the implications for the Park and the public in this or any other nomination.
- Mike Wells, Colorado Desert District, California State Parks Superintendent: Supports nomination. Future use of the archaeological site area is within the jurisdiction of CA State Parks. He requests that any recommendations for use (of the site area) be advisory only.

Following these three speakers, those submitting speaker slips were given three minutes each to make a statement. Those speaking include: Richard Alexander; Lynne Newell Christenson; Courtney Coyle; Alan Barrett, Viejas Band of Mission Indians; Peggy Martin, Cuyamaca Equestrian Association; Ernest Smith, Vice-President Cuyamaca Equestrian Association; Jolene Shmilack, Kumeyaay representative; Lynn Gamble; Mel Vernon, San Luis Rey Band of Mission Indians; Michael Curtis, volunteer at Cuyamaca State Park; Mike Sampson; David Hernandez, park volunteer; Kandy Franklin-Collins. Following these speakers, Susan Hector, James O'Keefe and Mike Wells were given time for rebuttal. Board discussion followed.

Board Action: Motion to approve staff recommendation by Paul Johnson, second by Eldonna Lay; Motion carried 5-0-1 (Carmen Lucas recused). Staff will prepare a Letter recommending support for the nomination of Cuyamaca Village to the National Register of Historic Places to be sent to the Office of Historic Preservation.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM 4 - HISTORIC SITE BOARD GOALS 2006 AND 2007

Description: Early each year, the Historic Site Board reviews goals set for the previous year and evaluates progress. The list of Goals is then updated for the current (2007) year. Setting goals is an on-going process that helps to guide the Historic Site Board throughout the year.

Meeting Notes: Because of time, the review of HSB goals was tabled until the May meeting.

ITEM 5 – FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Next meeting will take place on Monday, May 21, 2007 (third Monday)
- Modern home designed by John R. Mock in 1962; Hindman Residence (May)
- Frank & Charles Gifford Queen Ann Victorian 1890 farmhouse in Jamul (June)

ITEM 6– ADJOURNMENT

8:30 PM

APPROVAL OF BOARD MINUTES:

Chairman, Jim Royle

May 21, 2007

Vice-Chairman, Paul Johnson

May 21 , 2007